

# THE BENTHAM NEWSLETTER



JUNE 1985, No.9  
ISSN 0141 - 190 x

## CONTENTS

	<u>Page</u>
Editorial	3
Lord Robbins: A Tribute J.H. Burns	4
<u>Articles</u>	
Bentham's Digest David Lieberman	7
Bentham's Religious Writings: A Bibliographic Chronology James E. Crimmins	21
Jeremy Bentham and Adamantios Korais Paschalis M. Kitromilides	34
A Note on Bentham and Korais F. Rosen	49
The Correspondence: Recent Developments S.R. Conway	51
<u>Book Reviews</u>	
Robert Roth, <u>Pratiques Pénitenciaires et Théorie Sociale.</u> <u>L'Exemple de la Prison de Genève (1825-1862)</u> , Librairie Droz, Genève, 1981 L.J. Hume	53
Lea Campos Boralevi, <u>Bentham and the Oppressed</u> , Berlin and New York, de Gruyter, 1984 J.H. Burns	56
Alan Ryan, <u>Property and Political Theory</u> , Oxford, Basil Blackwell, 1984 P.J. Kelly	57
The Bentham Bibliography, Some Recent Additions	58

Paschalis M. Kitromilides  
University of Athens

During the first three decades of the nineteenth century Bentham's ideas found widespread appeal among intellectuals and political activists engaged in liberal causes around the world. His anticolonialism, his support for legal reform and institutional change, his prominent position in the reform movement in England and his leadership of 'philosophic radicalism' attracted the active interest and inspired the hopes of embattled liberals in distant and backward regions of the continent of Europe, such as Russia and the Iberian peninsula, in Latin America, and even in Northern Africa. The voluminous correspondence of the last period of his life bears ample evidence of this function of Bentham's political ideas. Bentham himself relished the interest aroused among reformers everywhere by his theories and never tired of encouraging it.

Among the representatives of the liberation and reform movements, who approached Bentham at the height of his international renown during the last decade of his life, were some spokesmen of revolutionary Greece. The full story of Bentham's involvement in the politics of Greek independence in both Greece and England remains to be written. This paper attempts to bring together the surviving evidence of the relationship between Jeremy Bentham and the foremost personality in the Greek cultural revival of the late eighteenth and the early nineteenth centuries, Adamantios Korais (1748-1833). After his medical studies at Montpellier, the distinguished Greek classical scholar came to Paris in 1788. Here, he witnessed and commented upon the French Revolution while working on his editions of ancient Greek medical texts. His editorial work on the classics established him as one of the leading philologists of his time. From 1805 until the end of his life he dedicated himself to the publication of a collection of classical texts with long prolegomena in modern Greek, aiming at the cultural and moral preparation of his compatriots for their liberation from the Ottoman yoke.<sup>2</sup> This became the consuming care of his life. It was this pre-occupation that motivated his communication with Bentham in the early 1820s.

The relations between Jeremy Bentham and Adamantios Korais can be considered on two levels. Firstly, on a 'micro-historical' level one can attempt to reconstruct the contacts and exchanges, direct and indirect, which constitute the basic components of the relationship between the two liberal thinkers. Secondly, on a theoretical level one can trace and appraise the influences exercised by Bentham's political theory upon Korais's thought, which was generally receptive to influences emanating from European intellectual currents. The significance of the first type of research consists in the possibility it offers for the partial elucidation of Bentham's involvement in the politics of the Greek War of Independence in the early 1820s. From the perspective of Greek history the reconstruction of the details of the attempts by Korais and his associates to approach Bentham can throw new light on the ways in which they strove in all directions for the promotion of the Greek cause. The combined involvement of both Bentham and Korais in the Greek struggle possesses, in addition, particular interest in that it illustrates the practical dimension of the theoretical concerns of the two thinkers. Their sensitivity to the practical implications of political theory constitutes a salient trait of their work. What follows is an attempt to illuminate a brief phase during which their mutual practical concerns brought the two thinkers in touch with one another.

The interest of the second type of research proposed above does not consist primarily in the opportunity it offers to confirm once again Korais's eclectic tendency to glean theoretical arguments from different European intellectual currents in order to add force and persuasiveness to his views on Greek cultural and political problems. Tracing influences across cultural borders and between individual thinkers can also be of interest to the extent that it provides evidence of ideological attitudes and orientations at the receiving end of the relationship. It is precisely for this reason that it is worthwhile to trace the appeal of Bentham's thought during the 'age of revolution'.

Korais was acquainted with Bentham's work mainly through Dumont's 1802 edition of Bentham's writings. This is the source primarily cited by Korais in his political writings, although he also occasionally used the 1818 French edition of Théorie des peines et des récompenses, and he was familiar with several of Bentham's pamphlets in the original. The three volume copy of Dumont's 1802 edition in the Korais library at Chios bears unmistakable evidence of Korais's attentive study. Bentham's text is indexed in detail in Korais's handwriting on the inside of the back cover of each of the three volumes.

Korais's original contact with Bentham's ideas might have been part of his preparatory work for the Greek edition of Beccaria's Of Crimes and Punishments,<sup>4</sup> which appeared in the same year as Dumont's edition. In his personal indexing of subjects in his copy of Dumont, Korais notes unfailingly all references to Beccaria in volumes I (pp.109, 111, 122, 152) and II (pp.37,385, 429). It is, however, doubtful that he consulted this particular source in connection with his project on Beccaria that appeared the very same year as the Dumont edition.

The evidence of Korais's writings seems to suggest that he read Dumont's edition at a considerably later date. Two aspects of Korais's Greek edition of Beccaria might be cited as evidence for this claim. First, a piece of external evidence is the absence of any reference at all to Bentham's work in the voluminous commentary that accompanies Beccaria's text. Second, the internal evidence of Korais's commentary likewise points in the opposite direction. Beccaria's text was interpreted by Korais as a pointer to a reformed political morality rather than as a model of rationalized legislation.<sup>5</sup> Only this latter reading of Beccaria could have turned Korais's attention to subjects that might have brought him in touch with Bentham's work at the time.

Apparently, Korais did not turn to Bentham's work until much later. The primary influences in his thought in the first two decades of the nineteenth century emanated from the intellectual milieu of the French Idéologues and these could not have directed his interest towards Bentham. Although contemporaries, the English utilitarians and the Parisian Idéologues generally ignored each other's intellectual projects. Bentham's correspondence offers no evidence of any ties or exchanges with the Idéologues,<sup>6</sup> although he did maintain contact with other French liberals.

Furthermore Korais's interests in the period up to the outbreak of the Greek War of Independence focused almost exclusively on philological, linguistic and cultural problems, and, therefore, he had little need for Bentham's ideas on politics and legislation. As with several other continental European and Latin American propagandists of Benthamism, Korais discovered the practical relevance of Bentham's work when the problems of state building and constitutional organisation impressed themselves with great urgency on his thinking as a consequence of revolutionary action in Greece.

The 'great tremour'<sup>7</sup> that shook Korais's soul upon hearing the news of the revolution provided the stimulus for the reorientation of his writing towards

political theory. The recovery of his older interests in this field provided the preconditions for a dialogue with Bentham's ideas. During the early 1820s, when Korais was seriously preoccupied with the appropriate constitutional organisation of newly liberated Greece, references to Bentham occur with remarkable frequency in his writings.<sup>8</sup> It was precisely during this period that the name of the English law reformer surfaces widely in ideological debates in revolutionary Greece.<sup>9</sup> This was largely the outcome of the propagation of his ideas by some of his disciples like Blaquiere and Stanhope who went to Greece seeking to assist the liberation struggle.

The pressing needs of the struggle and Bentham's favourable attitude towards the philhellenic movement encouraged certain officials of revolutionary Greece, as well as the ageing Korais, to appeal for his support for the Greek cause. Issues such as Bentham's involvement with the London Greek Committee, his communication with leading political personalities of revolutionary Greece such as Theodore Negris and Alexander Mavrocordatos, the mission of Orlando and Louriotis to London and their contacts with Bentham and the activities of Bentham's representatives,<sup>10</sup> notably Leicester Stanhope in Greece, are beyond the scope of this paper. The focus of the present analysis is on the contacts and exchanges between the two senior Enlightenment figures in the early years of the third decade of the nineteenth century. These contacts can be reconstructed on the basis of the evidence of four kinds of sources: (a) Bentham's unpublished correspondence; (b) the journal kept by Bentham's secretary, John Colls, in the years 1821-1825; (c) Bentham's personal notebook for the years 1822-1824; and (d) the surviving presentation copies of Bentham's works among Korais's books, now included in the collection of the Korais library at Chios. These unpublished materials, supplemented by other evidence that can be gleaned from published sources, provide a fairly complete record of the exchanges between Bentham and Korais and allow a reasonable appraisal of their respective motives and objectives during their communication between 1821 and 1824.

The initial contacts of Korais's circle with Bentham took place in August 1821 when Nicolaos Piccolos (1792-1865) arrived in London and approached Bentham in order to request his support for the Greek liberation struggle. In a letter dated September 1821 to his close associate Neophytos Vamvas, Korais refers to Piccolos's mission and specifies its purpose: 'we have recently sent the learned Piccolos to London in order to contact the local liberals and rekindle in our favour British public opinion, which is in disagreement with the attitude of their government'.

According to John Colls, two Greeks visited Bentham on 22 August 1821. He mentions by name only Piccolos who presented a letter of introduction from John Bowring.<sup>12</sup> On the following day Piccolos was invited by Bentham to dinner.

The discussions that ensued led Bentham to believe that Korais's circle might be an effective conduit for the promotion of his ideas in Greece. The prospect of the application of his ideas in the organisation of the fledgling new state constituted Bentham's primary motive in the receptivity he showed to Piccolos's and Korais's approaches. At his next meeting with Piccolos at dinner on 30 August 1821 Bentham presented him with copies of four of his recently printed works, one of which had not yet been officially published. Colls notes that Bentham gave to Piccolos the following works: 1. Codification; 2. Commercial Observations; 3. Liberty of the Press; 4. Three Tracts.<sup>13</sup> In his conversations with Piccolos, Bentham expressed his interest in learning the modern pronunciation of Greek. Piccolos responded by offering to assist him in this project and sent to Queen's Square Place a set of pertinent instructions, which have survived in

Bentham's papers.<sup>14</sup> Piccolos dined with Bentham for a last time on 4 October 1821 shortly before his departure for Paris.<sup>15</sup> During their farewell meeting Bentham gave him two letters and a book for his friend, Frances Wright, in Paris.

Through Piccolos, Bentham contacted Korais indirectly for the first time by sending him a copy of one of his works. In his entry for 3 October, Colls mentions that on that day he delivered to Piccolos 'a copy of Church Cat[echism] and a copy of Judicial Establishment.'<sup>16</sup> A copy of the latter work, Draught of a New Plan for the Organization of the Judicial Establishment in France (1790), has survived among Korais's books at Chios.<sup>17</sup> On the title page it bears the following dedication in Jeremy Bentham's hand:

To Doctor Coray  
from the Author.

We can safely conclude that this pamphlet was Bentham's gift to Korais. The Greek scholar made good use of Bentham's gift by citing it in his prolegomena to the second edition of Beccaria (1823) and in his commentary on the Provisional Constitution of Greece.<sup>18</sup> Both projects occupied his time in 1822, shortly after Piccolos's return from London.

In addition in Korais's library copies have survived of both On the Liberty of the Press and Public Discussion (1821)<sup>19</sup> and Three Tracts relative to Spanish and Portuguese Affairs with a continual eye to English ones (1821).<sup>20</sup> Copies of both of these pamphlets, as we just saw, were presented by Bentham to Piccolos. The two copies in Korais's library bear on the title page the following identical dedication in Bentham's handwriting:

To Dr Coray  
from Jeremy Bentham.

It is not unreasonable to suppose that these books were brought back to Korais by Piccolos. After his return to Paris, Piccolos, in a letter<sup>21</sup> dated 22 October 1821, transmitted his Mentor's warm thanks to Jeremy Bentham:

Monsieur Coray est très flatté du présent que vous  
lui avez fait. Il en sent tout le prix et vous prie  
d'en agréer ses remerciements.

A few months later Korais reciprocated Bentham's gesture by sending a copy of his recently published edition of Aristotle's Politics to the utilitarian philosopher. Korais had every reason to do this. Besides responding to Bentham's gracious initiative, by sending his edition of the Politics he could bring directly to the attention of the 'foremost contemporary teacher of political science',<sup>22</sup> his own use and acclamation of his work. Bentham certainly noted with satisfaction Korais's closing appeal in his long prolegomena to Aristotle whereby he recommended the translation of Bentham's writings into Modern Greek:<sup>23</sup>

It is eminently appropriate to Greece's current  
circumstances to have a chair and distinguished  
professor of politics in its major schools, where  
the Politics of Aristotle should be taught, inter-  
preted and compared with the political theories of  
modern philosophers. To this end it is necessary  
to translate the most important works of the latter  
and most essentially the writings of the wise law  
teacher Bentham. These works will benefit not only

the teachers and students of higher schools but will furthermore be of use to men of good upbringing in all stations of life, but especially to those who follow politics as a vocation.

Bentham's subsequent activity suggests that he took to heart Korais's advice to the revolutionary Greeks. Korais's counsel to his compatriots may not have been unrelated to Bentham's expectation of a Greek translation of his work.

The dispatch of Korais's edition of the Politics to Bentham was effected again through Piccolos. The latter's letter of 27 January 1822 from Paris indicates clearly that he knew very well what might most interest Bentham in Korais's gift:<sup>24</sup>

Monsieur,  
Je profite avec empressement de l'occasion de Mlle Wright pour vous transmettre de la part de Mr Coray un exemplaire de l'édition qu'il vient de donner de la politique d'Aristote. Il vous cite en plusieurs endroits et notamment dans l'avant dernière page de ses prolegomènes où il recommande la traduction de vos ouvrages. Il était tout naturel qu'en parlant de l'organisation politique de son pays, il puisât dans les écrits de celui des philosophes modernes qui a le mieux connu la nature humaine.

From Colls's journal we learn that Piccolos's letter was delivered to Bentham by Frances Wright on 4 February 1822.<sup>25</sup>

Bentham's indirect communication with Korais through Piccolos and Wright continued in the following months. Returning Korais's gift Bentham sent him later in the spring of 1822 a copy of still another newly published work with Wright. Piccolos on his way to Greece transmitted Korais's thanks in a letter to Bentham dated 30 June 1822 from Marseilles:<sup>26</sup>

Mon vénérable Monsieur,  
Je regrette vivement de n'avoir pu répondre à la belle et touchante lettre que vous avez fait l'honneur de m'envoyer par Miss Wright. J'ai reçu avec une égale reconnaissance vos nouvelles productions. Je les ai fait réunir aussitôt aux anciennes que je possède presque toutes. Mr Coray à qui j'ai remis l'exemplaire qui lui était destiné, m'avait chargé de vous offrir ses remerciements avec les miens.

On the basis of information in Colls's journal one could be led to suppose that Bentham's new gift to Korais might have been a copy of Supplement to Codification Proposal, eighteen copies of which were sent to Wright in Paris on 7 June 1822.<sup>27</sup> No copy of this work however has been preserved among Korais's books. On the contrary, in Korais's library one can find a presentation copy of Letters to Count Toreno on the proposed Penal Code, delivered by the Legislation Committee of the Spanish Cortes, (1822),<sup>28</sup> with the following dedication on the title page in Bentham's handwriting:

To Dr Coray  
from Jeremy Bentham.

This could have been Bentham's new gift to Korais in the spring of 1822.

Bentham did not remain indifferent to Korais's gift, which attested to the appeal of his ideas among the intellectual leadership of a nation fighting for its freedom. In a letter to the distinguished scholar and philanthropist Dr Samuel Parr on 17 February 1823, he cited Korais's reference<sup>29</sup> to his work as an encouraging sign of the increasing appeal of his ideas:

In a preface to his edition of Aristotle's Politics - a copy of which he sent me, forming the thirteenth volume of his *Ellenica Bibliotheca*, Paris, 1821 - Doctor Corai, a renowned literary leader of the Greeks a sojourner in Paris for the last thirty years, recommends it to his country to translate the works of Bentham, in preference to all others on Legislation. Having other intelligent disciples in that country, I have some reason to think something in that way has for some time been going on.

Bentham's enthusiasm must have been confirmed by Parr's response of 20 February 1823 which testifies<sup>30</sup> to Korais's high standing in the European republic of letters at the time:

Dr Corai is a scholar of the highest class: I have two of his works, which I read with great delight. His sagacity is worthy of his erudition and his authority is very great among all men of letters.

In subsequent years, despite many other preoccupations, Bentham did not stop thinking about Korais's gift. His diary shows that exactly two years after receiving it, on 5 February 1824, he had not lost interest in Korais's scholarly activity. On that day Bentham asked Wright, who was about to leave on one of her frequent visits to Paris, 'to see Piccolo and through him Corai' and 'through her to have the plan of that work of which Corai has sent to J.B. vol. 13'.<sup>31</sup> Bentham was specifically asking for 'a general table of its contents in French and English'. Bentham was obviously seeking information on the renowned *Hellenic Library*, the series of classical authors edited by Korais since 1805. The thirteenth volume in the series was Aristotle's *Politics* (1821), which Korais had sent to Bentham in January 1822.

During the period of his active involvement with the London Greek Committee, Bentham's thoughts often turned to Korais, especially whenever he came in touch with Greek spokesmen arriving in London in order to negotiate the Greek loan or to mobilise philhellenic sympathies. Immediately after the exchange with Parr, Korais's name surfaces again in Bentham's correspondence. In a letter of 2 March 1823 to Edward Blaquiere, Bentham refers to Louriotis's mission to London and mentions the latter's intention on his way back 'not to stay in Paris any longer than is necessary for a rapid conversation with Dr Korai'.<sup>32</sup> All this movement that revolved around them made the two ageing Enlightenment figures appear as the poles of efforts to sustain the Greek cause in Western Europe. For his part Korais did not tire throughout 1823 to acclaim Bentham's work and to underline its significance as a guide to the organisation of the new Greek state. In the prolegomena to the second edition of Beccaria he once again recommends to his compatriots to study 'with extra care all the writings of the famous Bentham'.<sup>33</sup> It is not known, however, whether this new public praise by Korais was ever brought to Bentham's attention.

What is certain, nevertheless, is that Bentham did not forget Korais and continued to hope that the Greek classicist of Paris might contribute substantively to the propagation of his ideas in the Greek world. On the evidence of his correspondence for the first half of 1824, Bentham, despite



his old age, and his busy writing schedule, was engaged in a truly frantic cycle of contacts and communications designed to promote the adoption of his constitutional views in the organisation of the new Greek republic.<sup>34</sup>

In that phase of his involvement in Greek affairs Bentham corresponded with Alexander Mavrocordatos, Theodore Negris, Orlandos and Louriotis as well as with his two utilitarian associates in Greece, Leicester Stanhope and Edward Blaquiére. Concurrently Bentham was actively at work on successive drafts of the Constitutional Code, which he hoped to project as a model not only of the prospective Greek constitution but, as a blueprint for constitutional and political reform throughout the world.<sup>35</sup> His hope was that a version of this work might be translated into Greek by Korais. This expectation was expressed in a letter dated 27 March 1824 to Stanhope. Bentham explained that Korais would supervise the translation, which, after its completion, was to be printed in Greece.<sup>36</sup> The same expectation was repeated in a letter to Theodore Negris dated 12 July 1824:<sup>37</sup>

Quant au Constitutionnel - un code, sur lequel j'ai travaillé à - peu - près deux années, manque peu d'être en état d'être envoyé en manuscrit à Paris, à votre excellent Docteur Corai, qui a eu la bonté de promettre d'en faire une traduction en Grec moderne, laquelle sera imprimée à Paris, et je crois avec l'Anglais à coté, pour les exemplaires en être distribués en Grèce.

For Bentham to talk about a promise by Korais to undertake the translation, something must have intervened since the rather indefinite expectation of the letter to Stanhope. The answer to this question is contained, I think, in the only known letter from Bentham to Korais, which constitutes the sole direct communication between the utilitarian philosopher and the Greek scholar. This letter, dated 12 August 1824, marks the culmination of the exchanges between Bentham and Korais. As the original draft in Bentham's manuscripts<sup>38</sup> lacks an address, postmark or docket, it is uncertain whether or not it was actually sent. This uncertainty has been compounded by the fact that no copy of the letter has survived in Korais's voluminous correspondence. A careful examination of the evidence of Colls's journal, however, can lead to more definite conclusions. In his entry of 13 August 1824, that is, on the day following the letter's date, Colls noted that Bentham sent a packet to Dr Coray in Paris through his Swiss editor and translator Etienne Dumont.<sup>39</sup> According to Colls the packet contained the following:

Dumont with a packet for Dr Coray Paris, consisting of

1. J.B. to Dr C.
2. Copy of Negris to J.B. & J.B. to Negris
3. Copy of J.B. to Mavrocordato
4. Book of Fallacies
5. Nos 1 & 2 of West Minster Review
6. Radical Reform Bill corrected

The first of the contents of the packet may well be Bentham's letter to Korais. The strong external evidence of Colls's journal can be supplemented with the internal evidence of the letter itself in support of the identification. From Bentham's letter we learn that through John Bowring's good offices Korais had agreed to take charge of the Greek translation of the Constitutional Code, by selecting the translators<sup>40</sup> and supervising their work. In the letter Bentham adds the following:

I avail myself of it [i.e. 'the present opportunity'] however so far as to transmitt a copy of a pamphlet of

mine, printed a few years ago and now by corrections in manuscript, fitted up, so as to serve for an Election Code which may form a sort of Appendix to the Constitutional Code.

This pamphlet was the Radical Reform Bill (1819), 'corrected',<sup>41</sup> which appears as the sixth item in Colls's list. Bentham goes on to remark:

Of the 12 Ministers whom the Constitutional Code establishes under the Prime Minister, (whose situation agrees for the most part with that of President in the Anglo-American United States) the Election Minister stands the first.

Bentham's observation on this issue, that had occupied him for some time, corresponds with the final formulation of his view in the Constitutional Code.<sup>42</sup> The Book of Fallacies which was also included in Bentham's packet to Korais as the fourth item was the most recent of Bentham's publications, having appeared earlier in 1824. Finally Bentham's references in the letter to copies of his correspondence with political personalities of revolutionary Greece, which he included in the packet, accord precisely with the evidence of Colls's list. The third item refers to a letter from Bentham to Mavrocordatos and this coincides exactly with the following sentence in the letter:<sup>43</sup>

Another letter you will I hope receive by this opportunity is a copy of mine to M. in answer to the last he sent me by the two Deputies.

Colls's information about the second item on his list concerning the letters exchanged between Bentham and Theodore Negris, makes possible some clarification of Bentham's rather cryptic references to this correspondence in the last paragraph of his letter to Korais.<sup>44</sup> The coincidences between Colls's list and the text of Bentham's letter to Korais leave no reasonable doubt, in my opinion at least, that the surviving text of 12 August 1824 is the original draft of the letter entrusted to Dumont for the Greek scholar in Paris. It is unfortunate that the other items in Colls's list, and especially the two works by Bentham, have not survived along with the rest of Bentham's works in Korais's library.

Bentham's appraisal of the situation in Greece in his letter to Korais, was based on information passed on to him by Stanhope, either directly after the latter's return to London or indirectly through Stanhope's letters to Bowring. Bentham's letter alludes to some of the most characteristic details of the attempts by his disciples<sup>45</sup> to propagate utilitarian principles and promote liberal ideas in Greece:

On his return hither from Greece, namely about the beginning of July my excellent Philhellenic friend the Honble. Leicester Stanhope gave me some information respecting some conversation of his with a distinguished functionary to whom he had learnt that you had sent a letter of good advice. That functionary acknowledged the having received a letter from you, and I believe, though not without reluctance shewed or read to him at first some extracts, and at length I believe the whole. Stanhope proposed his printing and publishing it: the proposition was not favorably listened to: on being urged, he consented to publish I know not what extracts, but refused to publish it entire. Stanhope said to me he expected (but I did not learn on what ground) that a copy would, from some other

quarter, find its way to the press, and become visible in Greece: that the production may have been accomplished, or at least may be accomplished, is of course my hearty wish. Through the influence of that functionary as supposed, the publication of some paper of mine was, for some time evaded: evaded but in vain: Stanhope's urgency for the publication of it not being thought fit to be resisted. To some observation of S.'s in approbation whether of my works in general, or some work in particular, as applying or applicable to the case of Greece, "Good in theory, not for practice": was the reply: an observation as trite as it is self contradictory, and of which an exposure is given if I mistake not, in the Volume on Sophismes forming the 2d Volume of the *Tactique des Assemblées Politiques*.

The 'distinguished functionary' alluded to by Bentham as recipient of a letter from Korais was Alexander Mavrocordatos.<sup>46</sup> Stanhope held him responsible for the attempt to suppress the publication of a Bentham passage in Greek translation in the proclamation of the *Hellenic Chronicle*, the newspaper initiated in 1824 at Missolonghi by the Swiss Philhellene Johann Meyer with Stanhope's financial assistance. This was the first translation of a Bentham text into Greek.<sup>47</sup> The reference to this incident is an indication of Bentham's trust in Korais and of his belief that the Greek liberal scholar was on the same side as the Benthamites in the ideological and partisan alignments dividing those involved in one way or another in the politics of the Greek War of Independence.

With his letter to Korais, Bentham tried to confirm an arrangement which, he hoped, might lead to the Greek translation of his treatise on representative democracy. The Greek translation and dissemination of his work in Greece, Bentham believed, could lead to the establishment of a legitimate, that is, democratic form of government in the country. For this reason, he explained to Korais that many of those who favoured oligarchical political institutions resented and tried to obstruct the spread of their ideas among the fighting Greeks.

The project on which Bentham focused his hopes, however, did not eventually bear fruit. Korais's multiple preoccupations in the last decade of his life, especially the continuing publication of the *Hellenic Library* and the *Parerga*, his whole-hearted involvement in the politics of Greek independence, as well as the condition of his health,<sup>48</sup> did not finally make possible his collaboration with Bentham. Considering this outcome of the Bentham-Korais relationship, one might consider some points of convergence and divergence in their respective political theories. Instead of translating Bentham's constitutional project, Korais opted for the composition of a political text of his own, in the form of a commentary on the first Greek constitution, which had been voted at Epidaurus on 1 January 1822 by the First Greek National Assembly.<sup>49</sup> Korais's decision was a conscious political act which gave authentic expression to his thought.

The existence of the two parallel commentaries on the 1822 *Provisional Constitution of Greece* by Korais and Bentham respectively offers a good possibility of a systematic comparison of their constitutional thought. Korais's constitutional and political ideas in his *Notes on the Provisional Constitution of Greece*<sup>50</sup> constitute a mature statement of his political thought. Confronted with the concrete needs and challenges of political action, Korais could not limit himself to the adaptation and transmission of European ideas into Greek culture through translation. With the explicit formulation of his political views, Korais was responding to the critical circumstances facing

his homeland, in a manner consonant with his classical moral sense. His constitutional commentary was an act whereby he fulfilled his public duty as a responsible citizen. Viewed in this perspective the final negative outcome and not the original objectives of the Bentham-Korais relationship is of essential significance for the understanding of the crystallisation of Korais's political thought during this period.

Their exchanges certainly confirmed the similarities in their political views, as may be seen by their common advocacy of a non-monarchical form of government and the subordination of the executive to the legislature. But Korais's political thought in this period differed fundamentally from that of Bentham. This is evident in the political attitude developed in his Notes on the Provisional Constitution of Greece. It is interesting to note that to the extent that he relies on Bentham in order to develop his arguments in this text, Korais does so by citing Bentham's early works. Nowhere in his commentaries do we find references to the writings of Bentham's later radical democratic phase, which, as we saw in this paper, reached Korais through Piccolos and Frances Wright in the early 1820s. On the contrary, Korais relies on considerably older works, reflecting Bentham's more orthodox, reformist, liberal phase, such as Draught of a New Plan for the Organization of the Judicial Establishment in France (1790) and Essay on Political Tactics (1791).

In this connection it is interesting to turn once more to the evidence of the surviving copies of Bentham's writings in Korais's library. Of the four presentation copies of works sent personally by Bentham to Korais only one, Draught of a New Plan, bears clear marks of having been read by Korais. Later works such as the brief pamphlet, Leading Principles of a Constitutional Code for any State, (1823)<sup>51</sup> which also survives in Korais's library has remained to this date with its leaves uncut. Korais seems to have bought also a copy of the French translation of Essais de Jérémie Bentham sur la situation politique de l'Espagne, (1823).<sup>52</sup> The copy of this book in his library contains a small handwritten signed note 'Pour Mr Coray', followed by some figures, which is apparently the receipt of the purchase. As noted above, however, of the Bentham works in Korais's library only the 1802 Dumont edition seems to have been closely read by Korais. Furthermore, among the numerous notes of his readings that have survived among his manuscripts, only a very brief one records his studies of Bentham's texts. This is a note of a sentence from Théorie des peines et des récompenses, (Vol.II, p.155) which Korais took down in Greek translation: 'The only virtue is concern for the public interest.'<sup>53</sup>

Korais's failure to use Bentham's later writings may suggest an inability to study them in his old age, under the pressure of his heavy writing commitments and his political engagements. It is tempting, however, to connect this failure with a hypothesis concerning the crystallisation of his political outlook. By not following Bentham in the direction of the democratic evolution of his views, Korais was essentially confirming his own attachment to the older liberal principles that had guided his political thought since the French Revolution. His ties with the Idéologues had strengthened this attachment which remained the framework of his thought when the challenge of the Greek Revolution impressed upon him the need to specify his ideas in concrete political prescriptions. In this task Bentham's influence was operative but rather ancillary. The decisive influence came from the direction of contemporary French liberals such as Constant and especially the liberal republicans de Tracy, Daunou and Lanjuinais.<sup>54</sup> The latter's constitutional views in particular had a more decisive impact than Bentham's on the essentials of Korais's outlook.<sup>55</sup>

This was not after all surprising. The evolution of Bentham's theory was intimately connected with political and social conflicts in England, and all this was completely foreign to the cultural context and the political priorities of Korais's thinking. In French liberalism he found a more familiar vocabulary in which to express his advice to his compatriots in his old age. Korais's failure to respond to Bentham's initiative was thus linked to the Greek scholar's political theory remaining firmly attached to the tradition of Enlightenment liberalism rather than turning towards a more radical democratic vision.

## NOTES

1. On the impact of Bentham's ideas cf. J.R. Dinwiddy, 'Bentham and the Early Nineteenth Century', The Bentham Newsletter, VIII (June 1984), 15-33.
2. Korais's social and political thought is analysed in my doctoral dissertation, Tradition, Enlightenment and Revolution: Ideological Change in Eighteenth and Nineteenth Century Greece, Harvard University PhD, 1978, pp. 229-50, 255-9, 409-62. I prefer the rendering 'Korais' which is closer to the Greek than the gallicized 'Coray', which was used by his contemporaries, including Bentham.
3. See Traité de législation civile et pénale...par M. Jérémie Bentham, Jurisconsulte Anglais. Publiés en Français par Et. Dumont, Paris, 1802, vols. I-II-III, Korais Library, Chios, Catalogue no. 1882. The Korais library at Chios possesses one of the richest collections of Bentham's works in Greece. Of the twelve titles six come from Korais's personal library while four others were included in the collection donated by Constantine Pitsipios, one of Korais's associates. This leaves basically only the brief pamphlet Leading Principles of a Constitutional Code for any State, extracted from The Pamphleteer, XLIV, London, 1823, with its provenance unaccounted for. It is likely that it too belonged to Korais. In the inventory of Korais's personal library, drawn up shortly after his death in 1833, the following titles of works by Bentham are recorded, without specification of the author's name:
  - Traité des preuves judiciaires, par Dumont, Paris 1823.
  - Tactique des assemblées législatives par le même, 1816.
  - Théorie des peines et récompenses par Dumont.
 See P.K. Enepekides, Documents notariaux inédits sur Adamantios Coray tirés des archives d'une étude parisienne et des Archives de la Seine, Berlin, 1959, p.16. Copies of all three of these editions exist in the Library of Chios. For more details on Bentham's works in Korais's possession see P.M. Kitromilides, 'O Korais meletetes tou Bentham', Mnemon, X (1985).
4. See Peri amartematon kai poinon politikos theoroumenon, trans. and ed. A. Korais, Paris, 1802.
5. The pertinent argument is developed in Tradition, Enlightenment and Revolution, op. cit., pp.428-33.
6. Bentham's most notable contact in France was General La Fayette. Despite his refusal to receive Benjamin Constant and Madame de Staël

in London, he did maintain some contacts with Constant to whom he sent some of his publications in 1824. Constant's acknowledgement is in UC x. 82. An exception among the Utilitarians in their attitude of indifference towards the Idéologues was James Mill, whose interest in psychology drew his attention to Cabanis's work. See Halévy, The Growth of Philosophic Radicalism, London, 1972, pp. 435-7.

7. See Aristotelous Politikon ta sozomena, ed. A. Korais, Paris, 1821, p. [142]. Numbers in square brackets refer to original Greek numbers.
8. Bentham is cited in the following of Korais's works: Aristotelous Politikon ta sozomena, op. cit., pp. [46], [98], [141], 290; Bekkariou peri adikematon kai poinon, 2nd ed., Paris, 1823, pp. [47-8], [49-51]; Semeioseis eis to Prosorinon Politeuma tes Hellados ed. Th. Volidis, Athens, 1933, pp. 65, 95, 109.
9. See Leicester Stanhope, Greece in 1823 and 1824, London, 1824, pp. 24, 39-41, 50, 55, 61, 63, 84, 86-7, 90, 97, 173 and especially 196-200. Stanhope's utilitarian zeal led him to exaggerated assessments of the appeal of Bentham's ideas. A more balanced view is given by Edward Blaquiére, The Greek Revolution, its Origins and Progress, London, 1824, pp. 309-10.
10. Among relevant sources in English see Evan Vallianatos, 'Jeremy Bentham's Constitutional Reform Proposals to the Greek Provisional Government, 1823-1825', Balkan Studies, X (1969), 324-34; P.J. Zepos, 'Jeremy Bentham and the Greek Independence', Proceedings of the British Academy, LXII (1976), 293-307; and William St. Clair, That Greece Might Still Be Free: The Philhellenes and the War of Independence, Oxford, 1972, pp. 147-9, 159-63, 186-7, 205-23. On Bentham's involvement in the affair of the Greek loan, see G.F. Bartle, 'Bowring and the Greek Loans of 1824 and 1825', Balkan Studies, III (1962), 61-74. Part of the pertinent correspondence is published by Eugène Dallegio, Les Philhellènes et la guerre de l'indépendance. Lettres inédites de J. Orlando et A. Louriotis, Athens, 1949, pp. 19-20, 157-75.
11. See A. Korais, Allelographia, IV (1817-1822), ed. C.Th. Dimaras et al., Athens, 1982, p. 309. Piccolos's mission to London has remained a mystery to his biographers. See E.G. Protosaltis, 'O Nikolaos Pikkolos kai to ergon tou', Athina, LXVIII (1965), 89-90. It is symptomatic of this state of research on Piccolos's life that the rich collection published by the Bulgarian Academy of Sciences, Dr Nicolas S. Piccolos. Etudes et documents inédits publiés à l'occasion du centenaire de sa mort (1865-1965), Sofia, 1968, is completely silent on Piccolos's visit to London.
12. Colls's Journal, British Library Add. MS 33563, fo. 85. On John Bowring's meeting with Piccolos and Korais earlier in 1821 cf. Autobiographical Recollections of Sir John Bowring, ed. with a brief memoir by Lewin B. Bowring, London, 1877, pp. 317, 323. Bowring's recollection of Korais (p. 323) captures the perception of the Greek intellectual leader in contemporary Philhellenic circles and deserves to be quoted in full:

CORAY.

To geronti Korae, as he called himself. I saw him in August 1821. The sons of Greece were gathered round him, and he was

listening to the different tales they brought of the progress of the struggle with the Turks. 'I foresaw all this, but I believed it would take place when my pilgrimage was over. I foresaw it;' and tears flowed fast from 'the old man's' cheeks. 'No, no,' said the young men who were about him; 'you shall return to Greece, and we will build you a monument.' A smile of grateful joy played upon the old man's countenance, and every tongue had some accent of kindness and of congratulation.  
- 1822.

13. Ibid., fo. 87
14. N. Piccolos to Jeremy Bentham, UC xii. 43-4. Cf. BL Add. MS 33563, fo.89.
15. BL Add. MS 33563, fo. 89.
16. Ibid.
17. Korais Library, Chios, Catalogue no. 1806.
18. See Bekkariou peri adikematon kai poinon, A. Korais, 2nd ed., pp. [49-51], and Korais, Semeioseis eis to Prosorinon Politeuma tes Hellados, p.109.
19. Korais Library, Chios, Catalogue no. 1716.
20. Korais Library, Chios, Catalogue no. 4449.
21. UC xii. 45.
22. Bekkariou peri adikematon kai poinon, 2nd ed., p.[47].
23. Aristotelous Politikon ta sozomena, p. [141].
24. UC xii. 47.
25. BL Add. MS 33563, fo.97.
26. UC xii. 84. On the relations between Korais and Piccolos at the time cf. Korais, Allelographia, IV, pp. 357-60.
27. BL Add. MS 33563, fo. 102.
28. Korais Library, Chios, Catalogue no. 1799. This is probably the work recorded in the 1833 inventory of Korais's library under the following title: Projet d'un code pénal. See Enepekides, Documents notariaux, p.16.
29. The Works of Jeremy Bentham, ed. John Bowring, 11 vols., Edinburgh, 1838-43, x. 535.
30. Ibid., 537.
31. UC clxxiii. 65.
32. UC xii. 103.
33. Bekkariou peri adikematon kai poinon, 2nd. ed., p. [51].
34. The relevant correspondence, which will appear as part of the new

edition of the Collected Works, is in UC xii.

35. On the history of the composition of the work, see Jeremy Bentham, Constitutional Code, vol. I, ed. F. Rosen and J.H. Burns, Oxford, 1983, (CW), pp. xi-xiv; note especially pp. xvi-xxxi on Bentham's involvement in Greek affairs.
36. UC xii. 268.
37. Bowring, iv. 586.
38. UC xii. 304-7.
39. BL Add. MS 33563, fo. 132.
40. UC xii. 304.
41. Ibid.
42. Cf. Constitutional Code, vol. I, (CW), p.171.
43. UC xii. 307. Cf. Bowring, iv. 589-92. For additional Bentham-Mavrocordatos correspondence see UC xii. 127-8, 289, 327.
44. UC xii. 307. Cf. Bowring, iv. 586-7 and UC xii. 283.
45. UC xii. 306.
46. Cf. Stanhope, Greece in 1823 and 1824, op.cit., p.82.
47. See Prokeryxis Hellenikon Kronikon, 18 December 1824. Cf. Stanhope, Greece in 1823 and 1824, op.cit., p.50. The journal's motto was a Greek rendering of the principle of utility. Bentham and his work are frequently mentioned in the pages of the Hellenic Chronicle. See especially no. 3 (9 January 1824), p. 3; no. 39 (14 May 1824), pp.2-3; no. 80 (1 October 1824), pp. 3-4; no. 81 (4 October 1824), pp.3-4; no. 82 (8 October 1824), pp.3-4; no. 83 (11 October 1824), pp.2-4; and no. 96 (26 November 1824), p.4.
48. See Bowring, iv. 586n.
49. For an English version of this text see, The Provisional Constitution of Greece, translated from the second edition of Corinth, accompanied by the original Greek; ... dedicated, with whatever profits it may produce, to the Greek committee by one of their members, London, 1823, reprinted Athens, 1975.
50. Korais worked on this text in 1822-1823, but it was never published in his lifetime. Its pronounced anti-monarchical bent caused it to remain unpublished until the establishment of the first Greek republic in the interwar period, when it was edited and published by Th. Volidis (Athens, 1933). A new edition by the author of this paper is forthcoming.
51. Korais Library, Chios, Catalogue no. 1720.
52. Korais Library, Chios, Catalogue no. 1800.
53. Korais Library, Chios, MS no. 375, fo.1.



54. Cf. Dominique Bagge, Les idées politiques en France sous la Restauration, Paris, 1952, pp. 144-58, on the relevant ideological background. Korais's attitude is characteristically expressed by his active involvement in the efforts to bring out a Greek edition of Francois Daunou, Essai sur les garanties individuelles que réclame l'état actuel de la société, Paris, 1819, which eventually materialised with the publication of Ph. Phournarakis's Greek translation in 1825. For details of this project see Ph. Iliou, 'Sten trochia ton Ideologon. Korais-Daunou-Phournarakes', Chiaka Chronika, X (1978), 36-68.
55. See especially Constitutions de la nation française avec un essai de traité historique et politique sur la charte et un recueil des pièces corrélatives par le Comte de Lanjuinais, Paris, 1819, vols. I-II, Korais Library, Chios, Catalogue no. 1802. Korais read this work closely as indicated by his notes which have survived as well as by his Greek translation of articles 1-17 of the 'Declaration des droits d l'homme et du citoyen' of 3 September 1791, which is based on the text published by Lanjuinais, vol. II, pp.165-7. See Korais Library, Chios, MS no. 306.